

Absent with Regret: S. Ahsan (Econ.), H. Bhabra (MBA), O. Bodur (Mktg.), T. Chirimar (CASA), M. El-Chafehi (CGSA), M. Elmosaly (CASA), E. Gatbonton (TESL), F. Lowy (Pres.), R. J. Oppenheimer (Mana.), J. Riven (Mana.), M. Singer (P&VP, AA)

[illegible]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

III Open Meeting

IV Approval of Agenda - JMSB-2004-08A

It was moved by G. Lowenfeld and seconded by M. Sharma that Council approve the agenda, JMSB-2004-08A.

It was moved by C. A. Ross and seconded by C. Draimin that the agenda be amended to add an urgent issue, the election of a member of the JMSB administration to represent the rank of Professor on the JMSB Council.

The mover and the seconder did not accept the amendment.

A vote was taken on the amendment.

The motion to amend was defeated. (4 in favor, 32 opposed, 0 abstentions)

The motion was carried (35 in favor, 1 opposed, 0 abstentions)

The Chair invited C. A. Ross to submit the issue to the Steering Committee to consider for the December meeting of Council.

V Approval of the Minutes - JMSB-2004-07M

It was moved by M. Sharma and seconded by S. Fontaine that Council approve the minutes of the meeting held October 22, 2004 with the following amendments: page 2, first paragraph, last sentence, delete 2004, insert 2003, page 4, last paragraph, fifth line, second to last sentence – insert fully before unranked ballots, page 7, last line, delete December 3, insert November 5.

The motion was carried unanimously.

VI Chair's Report and Question Period (maximum 15 minutes)

J. Tomberlin congratulated the Undergraduate Case Competition team on their success in placing among the top four finalists in the International Business Competition at the University of Texas at Austin. He reported that the Financial Times have continued to recognize the JMSB Executive MBA Program which ranked 43rd in the world, and 3rd among the 7 Canadian schools in their rankings. In response to the inquiry made at the last meeting regarding the content of ICAMER certificates, the Chair advised that the certificate states: The International Centre for Aviation Management Education and Research (ICAMER) jointly with the Aviation Security Section of the International Civil Aviation Organization (ICAO) confer upon the candidate the Certification of Aviation Security Management.

i) Centraide Presentation – M. Genova

M. Genova, Centraide Committee member, announced that the Centraide goal for the University was \$140,000. She encouraged participation in this worthy cause and advised that three weeks into the campaign payroll deductions totaled approximately \$4,000. Other fund raising measures include events such as last week's Halloween event and the forthcoming Annual Barber Shop, December 1st in the atrium. This year the JMSB's CIT will launch the CBuy Auction, an initiative that combines research in technology with an on-line calorie-free fund raising event. She demonstrated how to access the auction on the internet at CBuy.concordia.ca and invited all faculty and staff to join in the fun to support Centraide.

VII Elections

i) JMSB Election Panel

M. Jamal, Professor, Department of Management, was elected by secret ballot to replace C. Draimin as a Faculty Election Panel Member for the period beginning January 1, 2005 and terminating June 30, 2005.

VIII Business Arising from Previous Meeting

i) CGSA Report – JMSB-2004-07A-05 – The report was received.

A. Goussous reported that the second floor computer lab would be equipped with ten new computers by the end of month thanks to B. Ibrahim.

ii) CASA Report – JMSB-2004-07A-07 and JMSB-2004-08A-01.– The reports were received.

It was moved by G. Lowenfeld and seconded by J. Freed that the motion be amended to state that Council nominates the mover and seconder of the motion, C. A. Ross and C. Draimin, to prepare by the December meeting of Council and subject to a confidentiality agreement acceptable to the University, financial statements for each privatized program showing total annual revenues and total expenses on a full cost basis for each year over the last ten years.

The mover stated that he was not looking for forensic accounting. He expressed his surprise that some of his colleagues would believe the past to be irrelevant to the future plan for the JMSB and explained that the purpose of the exercise was to look at the future based on past experience. He further stated that he would be content to receive the financial data for the past four years.

In light of the willingness to accept four years of financial data, the mover was asked why the current reporting system for all private programs, that provides five years of information, was insufficient. The notion of assessing the performance pattern of each unit of the JMSB was supported as a step in the right direction by one member of Council. He stated that Council has a golden opportunity to dovetail this exercise with the strategic plan and ensure that the assessments are conducted in a systematic and professional manner by a group, one of the task forces identified in the strategic plan.

It was asked if amending the number of years from ten to four years would be a friendly amendment. The seconder stated that there was no reason to limit the numbers of years because the figures have been published in the past and can be retrieved.

It was pointed out that Mr. English's title has been changed to Vice-President, Finances.

One member of Council called a point of order because the discussion had gone over the 15 minutes time limit.

The question on the amendment was called:

The mover and the seconder agreed that the amendment was a friendly amendment.

One member of Council stated that he was wholeheartedly in favor of getting the financial information that his two colleagues have requested. The key issue is what we are going to do with it? He stated that the notion of discussing this information at Council would be moving into a muddy area and he did not think that his colleagues, Professors Ross and Draimin, or other members of Council wanted to do that. The spirit of the motion and the discussion is noted, now we must look for an appropriate mechanism.

The vote was called.

The mover stated that he was prepared to withdraw the motion.

The Chair stated that once the vote has been called, the Council must proceed to vote.

JMSB-2004-08M

The mover stated that according to Robert's Rules, he could not withdraw the motion without the supporting voice of Council members.

The Chair repeated that the vote must go forward.

The motion was carried (15 in favor, 11 opposed, 4 abstentions)

- iv) Executive MBA Program Report – JMSB-2004-08A-02 (*maximum 15 minutes*)
It was moved by G. Lowenfeld and seconded by A. B. Ibrahim that Council give speaking privileges to B. Barbieri, Acting Director, Executive MBA Program.

B. Barbieri highlighted the report noting the projected deficit for the year is now approximately \$166,000 due to a drop in enrolment from 18 to 17 in year one. He advised that any decline in enrolment this year would further increase the projected deficit. He reported that the JMSB Executive MBA had been ranked among the top three in Canada by the Financial Times. He stated that his goal as Acting Director was to recruit sufficient enrolment to turn a profit while maintaining a quality program. He advised that the Paris EMBA with an enrolment of 18 to start the fourth year of operation in April 2005, was progressing well and enhances the ongoing branding of the JMSB.

In reply to a question about the number of students admitted without a Bachelors degree, B. Barbieri advised that three of the seventeen newly admitted students did not have a degree. It was pointed out that last year's report had a breakdown of expenses. B. Barbieri agreed to provide an identical breakdown of expenses for 2003-2004. It was suggested that the program be delivered one day a week on Sundays, a method that has had excellent results for another institution. B. Barbieri stated that it was not planned for this year as the focus was on quality and target markets however it may be considered for the future.

It was moved by L. Switzer and seconded by M. Sharma that Council receive the Executive MBA Program Report, JMSB-2004-08A-02.

B. Barbieri was asked why revenues have declined by approximately \$300,000 and why roughly 25% of the students have dropped out. He explained that the revenues come from tuition. Since the last two years' enrolment has been lower than the previous two years there has been a substantial loss of revenue. With regard to the drop out rate, he advised that students were sometimes overwhelmed by the pressure of responsible positions, heavy course work and family demands. It was suggested that future reports provide enrolment data for past years.

B. Barbieri advised that the EMBA would not qualify for the Financial Times rankings this year because they exclude programs with less than twenty students enrolled.

Dean Tomberlin returned and assumed the Chair.

The decline in employer sponsorship was noted and it was pointed out that this may reflect a major trend in employee development and training for generation Xers who look for balance between work and family life. It was suggested that a one-day Sunday program may be more attractive to this target group. B. Barbieri advised that rather than

compress the program to one day-a-week, the plan for this year's recruitment is to appeal to this group by emphasizing the quality of the program that provides scheduled breaks in study to allow students to balance their lives.

The motion was carried unanimously.

A vote of thanks for B. Barbieri was moved by M.Sharma and seconded by B. Ibrahim.

- v) Concordia: Canada's University for the 21st Century (SCAPP 2004-3-D1) JMSB-2004-07A-06
B. Ibrahim advised that the Provost would appreciate receiving feedback from faculty on the document.

It was moved by I. Rakita and seconded by J. Freed that this item be tabled.

The motion was carried unanimously.

- vi) Motion regarding Governance of Faculty Centres -JMSB-2004-08A-03
The following resolution was moved by C. A. Ross and seconded by C. Draimin;

WHEREAS the JMSB has numerous projects ('Centres') which can benefit from the synergies of coordination;

WHEREAS greater transparency is required for Faculty departments and members to understand and respond to the requirements of the Centres;

WHEREAS Faculty Council needs a governance structure to fulfill its responsibilities of oversight of such activities;

WHEREAS, in the past, such Centres as the Executive Centre, ICAMER, and the Entrepreneurship Institute for the Development of Minority Communities have not been required to develop and maintain standardized internal controls;

BE IT RESOLVED:

- 1) That Faculty Council direct each present Centre to form a committee ('Policy Committee') responsible for developing a mandate for the Centre, and for overseeing planning and budgetary processes and controls as required by Faculty Council from time to time, and for reporting to Faculty Council;*
- 2) That the mandate developed by each committee be deposited at Faculty Council no later than the February meeting, 2005;*
- 3) That each Policy Committee be composed of at least one independent member to be selected by and from each department ('independence', in this context, means not having taught in the centre during the 12 months prior to being selected);*
- 4) That the Director of each centre be required to submit a financial and operations report at least annually to Faculty Council;*
- 5) That all future Centres be required to adhere to the requirements set forth in this resolution*

C. A. Ross stated that the motion addresses concerns about issues of governance in the Faculty, as well as the performance and the reputation of the JMSB eliminating the autonomy of the Centres by establishing committees to oversee each centre.

The spirit of the motion was applauded by one Council member who pointed out that issues of corporate governance require an external review of performance to avoid conflict of interest. He stated that the notion of finding qualified committee members from each department when faculty members are already overburdened with committee work would not be practical. Lastly he stated that inasmuch as the JMSB had an Advisory Board composed of external members, this mechanism was unnecessary.

The mover and the seconder agreed that the deletion of the phrase 'from time to time' from resolution 1) and the insertion of 'or as determined by Council' at the end of the definition of "independence) in resolution 3) was a friendly amendment.

One member of Council expressed his frustration with the increasing bureaucracy in the Faculty. Another member of Council agreed with the spirit of the motion stating that everyone wants proper governance but faculty members need to work together to find the appropriate mechanisms. He again pointed out the strategic plan provides a golden opportunity to work together to establish mechanisms to assess the performance, financial status and directorship of all units of the Faculty. Voting for or against the many motions at Council promotes divisiveness. He asked his colleagues, Professors Ross and Draimin, to consider working within the framework of the strategic plan to resolve these concerns because it was inappropriate and unprofessional for the members of Council to undertake a responsibility that does not fit with a school that prides itself on teaching management education. This sentiment was supported by a member of Council who stated that Council members were frustrated by the ongoing motions. She stated that the common goal of achieving good corporate governance and transparency would be achievable if everyone took the strategic planning seriously.

It was pointed out that the privatized programs already conformed to resolution 4) by reporting to Council on an annual basis. The assumption of increased accountability from a committee rather than an individual was questioned.

The question was called by J. Freed.

Calling a point of order, the mover of the motion objected to the question being called stating that it was not a correct interpretation of Roberts Rule. He challenged the Chair.

A Council member pleaded for order in Council and asked the Chair to permit the mover and the seconder time to respond to the comments made.

The Chair stated that the call for the question was not debatable. He added that it was not his intent to restrict discussion, merely to follow the rules of order.

The mover withdrew the challenge to the Chair.

J. Freed withdrew the call for the question.

The mover stated that his objective was not to be obstructive but to assure proper governance for the various Centres in the Faculty. He further stated that the motion was appropriate for discussion at Council particularly in light of the fact that the strategic plan does not address governance issues. He went on to say that the proposed committee structure would ensure that departments were aware of the activities in the Centres and consequently Council meetings would be smoother. He agreed that faculty members were already overburdened by committee work nonetheless faculty members would be derelict to forsake proper governance to avoid increased bureaucracy.

J. Tomberlin stated that he had no objection to the spirit of the motion. Although the Centre for Instructional Technology is called a Centre, it differs from the three mentioned in the motion in that they provide non-credit training or executive development to the external community. He further stated that part of the strategic plan includes reorganization whereby these units could be placed under one umbrella. Rather than creating three committees of fifteen people he recommended that a smaller group oversee the Centres and agreed to put this issue in the forefront of the reorganization in the strategic plan.

It was pointed out by one faculty member that the Centres were exceptional within the Faculty in that all other programs have operational committees. Although he agreed with the Chair's idea of having one committee for all Centres he strongly suggested that the committee be established now.

The seconder proposed an amendment:

That Faculty Council organize an external program committee to develop a program for each centre.....

The Chair suggested that consideration be given to the wording of the amendment.

The mover and the seconder agreed, with Council's permission, to reword the motion and bring forward a revised motion for the December meeting of Council.

It was moved by G. Lowenfeld and seconded by M. Paulin that the motion be tabled until the December meeting of Council. The motion was carried unanimously.

- viii) Faculty Election Procedures -JMSB-2004-07A-03
This item will be discussed at the next meeting of Council.

IX Report: Graduate Programs, Research and Program Evaluation

- i) Changes to INC and IP Notations in the Undergraduate Calendar proposed by the Faculty of Arts and Science – JMSB-2004-08A-04
G. Kanaan explained the proposed revisions. The first part of the section on INC was intended to assure that the number of days between the end of the examination period and the application for incomplete was uniform across different terms and sessions. The second part was intended to ensure that INCs were replaced by grades by November 15th of each year. IP grades were being introduced at the undergraduate level for specific cases such as student internships or directed study and research.

It was moved by G. Kanaan and seconded by C. A. Ross that Council support the spirit of the Arts & Science recommendation for Undergraduate Calendar changes as described in document JMSB-2004-08A-04. The motion was carried unanimously.

- X Report: Administrative Affairs and Human Resources
There was nothing to report.
- XI Standing Report on the status of the new JMSB building
There was nothing to report.
- XII CGSA Report
There was nothing to report.
- XIII Report: External Affairs and Executive Programs
There was nothing to report
- XIV Report: Undergraduate Programs, Academic and Student Affairs
There was nothing to report.

There were no reports from JMSB representatives on the following committees:

- XV Reports from School Representatives on University Committees
 - i) University Senate
 - ii) Arts and Science Faculty Council
 - iii) Senate Academic Planning and Priorities
 - iv) Senate Academic Programs Committee
 - vi) University Library Committee
 - vii) Undergraduate Scholarships and Awards Sub-committee
 - viii) Board of Governors
 - ix) Council of the School of Graduate Studies
 - v) Senate Research Committee - JMSB-2004-08A-05
The Senate Research Committee Report prepared by L. Shanker was received.

XVI CASA Report

- XVII New Business
 - i) Goodman Institute of Investment Management Report – JMSB-2004-08A-06
It was moved by G. Kanaan and seconded by C. A. Ross that Council grant speaking privileges to A. Hochstein, Director, Goodman Institute of Investment Management
The motion was carried unanimously.

A. Hochstein highlighted the report noting the increasing enrolment in spite of the downward trend in MBA programs.

It was moved by M. Paulin and seconded by A.-M. Croteau that Council receive the Goodman Institute of Investment Management Report.

In response to one faculty member's questions, A. Hochstein confirmed that (i) the arrangement with CIMI was an admissions policy with no academic responsibility for the students, (ii) the projected contribution to the Faculty of \$80,000 was based on the current fee structure and (iii) the program is not charged overhead by the University or the JMSB. With regard to a question of Mr. Goodman's commitment to invest further in the program, the Chair advised that he has put money into the Goodman Scholarship program and promises more. In reply to a question about the failed students, A. Hochstein advised that these students were overconfident and were not well prepared for the rigor of the CFA exams. One member of Council questioned why the breakeven in last year's report was 60 students and this year's breakeven is 75 students. A. Hochstein explained that expenses increased during the past year -students who failed the CFA remain in the program and generate expenses. In addition the technology alone costs \$600 per month however there is a plan to reduce these costs by working off the internet. He also asked why there was a discrepancy in the financial figures reported last year and those reported this year. A. Hochstein advised that they were Banner figures that can be revised during the year. For example an expense can be charged to the wrong account and subsequently corrected resulting in such discrepancies. One member of Council stressed the importance of privatized programs networking with their students to create marketing and branding opportunities. Concern was noted from a Council member about allowing marginal students to go forward and fail. A. Hochstein advised that the best method of ensuring success is to admit only high quality students to the programs.

A. Hochstein was asked where classes were held in Toronto, if the projection for 2004-2005 was in fact the budget and why do we continue to provide students who failed the CFA examination with books and supplies. He responded that classes were held at 20 Bay Street in three high-tech classrooms, projection reflects the current budget, and the program regulations approved by the University provide for the continued support of the students.

A. Hochstein thanked Associate Dean Ibrahim, Dean Tomberlin and Associate Dean Magnan's office for their support. He noted the huge cost of operating this specialized program while at the same expressing his confidence that it would continue to enhance the reputation of the John Molson School of Business.

With regard to the concern about allowing unprepared students to move forward, one faculty member suggested that rather than blame the students the issue of grade inflation may need to be investigated.

The motion was carried unanimously.

XVIII Other Business

XIX Adjournment

It was moved by C. A. Ross and seconded by J. Freed that the meeting be adjourned.

The motion was carried unanimously.

The meeting was adjourned at 12:50.

XX Next meeting

The next regular meeting of Council will take place on Friday, December 3, in room GM302 at 09:30.